22 June 2018

Mr Kyam Maher MP
Parliament House
North Terrace
ADELAIDE SA 5000

Sent by email: maher.office@parliament.sa.gov.au

Dear Mr Maher

Freedom of information application

I refer to your request received by the Office of the Premier seeking access under section 13 of the Freedom of Information Act 1991 (the Act) to:

DPC18/1584 - Any and all documents - including but not limited to physical, electronic or written advice and briefs, tender documents, minutes, emails and any other correspondence - regarding the issues arising from the awarding of a new contract for the provision of creative services to the South Australian (SA) Tourism Commission between 19 March 2018 and 7 May 2018 inclusive

DPC18/1585 - Any and all documents - including but not limited to physical, electronic or written advice and briefs, tender documents, minutes, emails and any other correspondence - regarding the establishment from the awarding of a new contract for the provision of creative services to the South Australian (SA) Tourism Commission between 19 March 2018 and 7 May 2018 inclusive

The Department for the Premier and Cabinet (DPC) is responsible for providing determinations on behalf of the Office of the Premier. Under the Act, an agency has 30 days to respond to a freedom of information request. As DPC did not respond to your request within the time frame required, the department is deemed to have refused you access to all documents relevant to your application. However, I have determined to process the request as if the statutory time frame had been met.

Seventeen documents were identified as answering the terms of your application and I have determined as follows:

- I grant you access in full to 9 documents;
- I grant you access in part to 6 documents;
- I refuse access in full to 2 documents.
Documents released in part

Documents 1, 4, 9 and 11

These documents consist of information relating to the personal affairs of third parties. Under clause 6(1) of Schedule 1 to the Act, a document is exempt if its disclosure would involve the ‘unreasonable disclosure of information concerning the personal affairs of any person’. This information falls within the definition of personal affairs under the Act and is therefore exempt from release pursuant to clause 6(1).

Document 6

These documents contain information that has commercial value to third parties the disclosure of which could destroy or diminish its value. This information contains the South Australian Tourism Commission’s (SATC) assessment of the parties, which if released would have an adverse effect on their business, placing them at a competitive disadvantage in future commercials dealing.

Information is exempt if it has a reasonable expectation that disclosure of this information will prevent the future supply of information to the government. If disclosed the information within these documents could be reasonably expected to have an adverse effect on the future supply of such information and negatively impact on the government’s ability to negotiate the successful tender and get best value for money.

The SATC operates in an increasingly competitive tourism sector. The SATC undertakes tenders to secure a wide range of services in order to promote the state, to attract greater visitation which in turn delivers significant economic and social benefits for our state.

I acknowledge that there is a strong public interest in the public being able to scrutinise the government’s tender processes. In my view, however, this is outweighed by the need to ensure that companies submitting tenders are not disadvantaged by the release of commercially valuable information. Release of this information could diminish SATC’s ability to conduct competitive tender processes in the future. I have therefore determined to remove these details pursuant to clause 7(1)(b) and clause 7(1)(c) of Schedule 1 to the Act.

Documents 6 and 8

These documents also contain internal working processes and factors. Disclosure of this material would reveal details which would prejudice the SATC’s ability to conduct competitive tender processes in the future. I have determined to refuse the release of this information pursuant to clause 16(2) to of Schedule 1 to the Act.

Documents refused in full

Documents 15 and 17

These documents are Parliamentary Briefing Notes prepared specifically for use in Parliament, the disclosure of which would infringe the privilege of Parliament. I have therefore determined to exempt the documents in full pursuant to clause 17(c) of Schedule 1 to the Act.
Clause 6 – Documents affecting personal affairs

(1) A document is an exempt document if it contains matter the disclosure of which would involve the unreasonable disclosure of information concerning the personal affairs of any person (living or dead).

Clause 7 – Documents affecting business affairs

(1) A document is an exempt document—

... (b) if it contains matter—

(i) consisting of information (other than trade secrets) that has a commercial value to any agency or any other person; and

(ii) the disclosure of which—

(A) could reasonably be expected to destroy or diminish the commercial value of the information; and

(B) would, on balance, be contrary to the public interest; or

(c) if it contains matter—

(i) consisting of information (other than trade secrets or information referred to in paragraph (b)) concerning the business, professional, commercial or financial affairs of any agency or any other person; and

(ii) the disclosure of which—

(A) could reasonably be expected to have an adverse effect on those affairs or to prejudice the future supply of such information to the Government or to an agency; and

(B) would, on balance, be contrary to the public interest.

Clause 16 – Documents concerning operations of agencies

... (2) A document is an exempt document if —

(a) it relates to an agency engaged in commercial activities; and

(b) it contains matter the disclosure of which could prejudice the competitiveness of the agency in carrying on those commercial activities.

Clause 17 – Documents subject to contempt etc

A document is an exempt document if it contains matter the public disclosure of which would, but for any immunity of the Crown—
In compliance with Premier and Cabinet Circular PC045 - Disclosure Logs for Non-Personal Information Released through Freedom of Information (PC045), DPC is now required to publish a log of all non-personal information released under the Freedom of Information Act 1991.

In accordance with this Circular, any non-personal information determined for release as part of this application, may be published on the DPC website. A copy of PC045 can be found at the following address: http://dpc.sa.gov.au/what-we-do/services-for-government/premier-and-cabinet-circulars Please visit the website for further information.

Right to internal review

If you are aggrieved with this determination, you have a right to apply for internal review under subsection 29(1) of the Act. Pursuant to subsection 29(2), your application must:

- be in writing
- be addressed to the principal officer, and
- be lodged at an office of DPC, or emailed to DPCFOIUnit@sa.gov.au within 30 days after the day on which you receive this letter or within such further time as the principal officer may allow.

If you have any questions in relation to this matter, please contact Denise Cranwell, Freedom of Information Officer, on telephone 8429 5299 or via email at denise.cranwell@sa.gov.au.

Yours sincerely

Georgia Lygoe

ACCREDITED FOI OFFICER
Freedom of information application from Kyam Maher seeking access to ‘all documents - including but not limited to physical, electronic or written advice and briefs, tender documents, minutes, emails and any other correspondence - regarding the establishment and/or awarding of, and issues arising from the awarding of a new contract for the provision of creative services to the South Australian (SA) Tourism Commission between 19 March 2018 and 7 May 2018 inclusive’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Document description</th>
<th>Exemption clauses</th>
<th>Released (part/full/refused)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>23/04/2018</td>
<td>Email</td>
<td>Clause 6(1)</td>
<td>Part</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>24/04/2018</td>
<td>Attachment 1 to document 1</td>
<td>Full</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>26/04/2018</td>
<td>Email</td>
<td>Full</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>26/04/2018</td>
<td>Email</td>
<td>Clause 6(1)</td>
<td>Part</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>26/04/2018</td>
<td>Email</td>
<td>Full</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>17/04/2018</td>
<td>Attachment 1 to document 6</td>
<td>Clause 7(1)(b)</td>
<td>Part</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Clause 7(1)(c)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Clause 16(2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>26/04/2018</td>
<td>Email</td>
<td>Full</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>27/04/2018</td>
<td>Email</td>
<td>Clause 16(2)</td>
<td>Part</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>27/04/2018</td>
<td>Email</td>
<td>Clause 6(1)</td>
<td>Part</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>28/04/2018</td>
<td>Email</td>
<td>Full</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>30/04/2018</td>
<td>Email</td>
<td>Clause 6(1)</td>
<td>Part</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>02/05/2018</td>
<td>Attachment 1 to document 11</td>
<td>Full</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Attachment 2 to document 11</td>
<td>Full</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Email</td>
<td>Full</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### SCHEDULE OF DOCUMENTS—DPC18/1584 and DPC18/1585

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Document description</th>
<th>Exemption clauses</th>
<th>Released (part/full/refused)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Attachment 1 to document 16</td>
<td>17(c)</td>
<td>Refused</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>03/05/2018</td>
<td>Email</td>
<td></td>
<td>Full</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Attachment 1 to document 18</td>
<td>17(c)</td>
<td>Refused</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Wood, Lucinda (DPC)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>From:</th>
<th>Franchitto, David (DPC)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sent:</td>
<td>Wednesday, 16 May 2018 8:28 AM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To:</td>
<td>Wood, Lucinda (DPC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject:</td>
<td>FW: Media Statement- Creative services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attachments:</td>
<td>Media Statement- Creative Services Tender.docx</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**From: Jhaveri, Sibil (SATC)**

| Sent:         | Monday, 23 April 2018 1:18 PM |
| To:           | Franchitto, David (DPC) <David.Franchitto@sa.gov.au> |
| Cc:           | Tuffnell, Ben (SATC) <Ben.Tuffnell@sa.gov.au> |
| Subject:      | Media Statement- Creative services |

Hi David,

Further to your discussion with Ben, here is a draft of the messaging for the Creative Services Tender. I am waiting for some information to update the jobs statement and will share that as soon as I have it.

Let me know if you need anything else in the meantime.

Cheers

Sibil

**Sibil Jhaveri**

Corporate Communications Manager

Corporate Communications

---

**South Australian Tourism Commission**

Level 3 121-125 King William Street

Adelaide South Australia 5000

GPO Box 1972 Adelaide SA 5001

T 08 8463 4626
E Sibil.Jhaveri@sa.gov.au
W southaustralia.com
W tourism.sa.gov.au

---

The information in this e-mail may be confidential and/or legally privileged. It is intended solely for the addressee. Access to this e-mail by anyone else is unauthorised. If you are not the intended recipient, any disclosure, copying, distribution or any action taken or omitted to be taken in reliance on it, is prohibited and may be unlawful.
SATC Creative Services Tender Outcome

Communication Timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Who</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tuesday 24th April</td>
<td>Advise TBWA and allow 48 hours for TBWA to prepare formal response that they accept our offer</td>
<td>SATC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thursday 26th April PM</td>
<td>Advise KWP (in person) and all other unsuccessful agencies (by phone/email) of outcome – scheduled for no earlier than 3pm</td>
<td>SATC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Advise SATC staff</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friday 27th April</td>
<td>Unsuccessful letters to be sent out via email and post</td>
<td>SATC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Media Statement

The SATC has worked with the incumbent agency KWP! for 20 years and the current Creative Services contract with KWP! expires on 30 June 2018. The State Procurement Board requires that all agencies undertake an open market process for new contracts. The procurement process was undertaken in accordance with the State Procurement Board guidelines and the market approach was an open Request for Tender (RFT). Five agencies were short-listed from a total of 35 who submitted entries and were initially evaluated by the panel facilitated throughout by an in-house Procurement Consultant. Four of the five agencies shortlisted were based interstate, with the incumbent KWP! being the only Adelaide based agency.

The SATC has appointed TBWA as the lead global agency for creative services, following this rigorous State procurement process.

TBWA is part of the Omnicom Group of companies with a worldwide network of media and communication agencies allowing the SATC access to a global creative talent pool. The agency is equipped to meet our creative services needs in our key international and domestic markets.

In addition, local Adelaide agencies Blacksheep, Fuller and Showpony were selected as Secondary agencies to take on ad hoc projects and tactical campaigns for the domestic market.

We thank the KWP! team for their hard work and commitment and wish them all the best for the future. We have shared many wins with KWP! along this 20-year journey. The campaigns designed by KWP! have been instrumental in our journey to a $6.6 bn visitor economy.

The 2020 tourism target of $8bn calls for a fresh perspective and some disruptive strategies which we believe TBWA is best placed to deliver.
Secondary Message

TBWA demonstrated impressive creativity, fresh, insightful thinking, excellent account management experience as well as in-depth understanding of the digital Adobe Marketing Cloud system and its ability to enhance the customer journey experience. They demonstrated contemporary knowledge of the national and global tourism landscape including the challenges South Australia faces.

KWP! – Secondary Message

Each creative agency brings a different perspective, approach and strengths to the table in the pitch process and while a 20-year relationship with KWP! has merits and comfort factor, we believe our 2020 tourism target calls for some fresh disruptive strategies brought to life through a new approach which we believe TBWA can deliver.

Anticipated Questions

Why is SATC using an interstate agency instead of a local one?

TBWA is a global agency, the SATC markets to a global audience and the agency is equipped to meet our needs in both domestic and international markets e.g. Shanghai and Auckland. TBWA has committed to opening an office space with an account team based in Adelaide upon commencement of the contract to service the SATC.

The Adelaide team will be supported by TBWA/Melbourne and where possible its international offices, including Shanghai and Auckland, will also work with the SATC’s overseas teams.

How many staff will be employed in the Adelaide office?

TBWA plans to employ two account management staff in the initial stage with the potential to add more staff in the future based on business growth. (to be updated)

What is the role of the secondary agencies versus TBWA?

TBWA as the lead agency will be responsible for our overarching creative campaigns in domestic and international markets. The secondary agencies will be brought on board on an ad hoc basis for tactical campaigns for the domestic market.

What is the size of the contract and for how many years has it been awarded?

The value of the contract is commercial in confidence. TBWA has been signed on for XX years.
Wood, Lucinda (DPC)

From: Franchitto, David (DPC)
Sent: Wednesday, 16 May 2018 8:28 AM
To: Wood, Lucinda (DPC)
Subject: FW: Creative Services additional info

From: Schutz, Cecilia (DTTI)
Sent: Tuesday, 24 April 2018 3:44 PM
To: Franchitto, David (DPC) <David.Franchitto@sa.gov.au>
Subject: Fwd: Creative Services additional info

Further info on TBWA and also SATC panels involved in the decision

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Tuffnell, Ben (SATC)" <Ben.Tuffnell@sa.gov.au>
Date: 24 April 2018 at 1:10:36 pm GMT+8
To: "Schutz, Cecilia (DTTI)" <Cecilia.Schutz@sa.gov.au>
Cc: "Ferraro, Carmela (SATC)" <Carmela.Ferraro@sa.gov.au>, "SATC:Executive Assistant to CE" <SATCExecutiveAssistanttoCE@sa.gov.au>, "Harrex, Rodney (SATC)" <Rodney.Harrex@sa.gov.au>
Subject: Creative Services additional info

Hi Cecilia

As discussed at our recent meeting with yourself and the Minister please find below some additional information with regards the creative services tender.

The SATC tender panel members:

Brent Hill, Executive Director Marketing
Bev Bury, Snr Marketing Manager
Stacey Cant, SATC overseas representative New Zealand
Allan Gadd, SATC procurement consultant (probit officer)

SATC APU members:

Rod Harrex, CEO (Chair)
Ben Tuffnell, ED Corporate Affairs
Stephanie Rozokos, CFO
Adam Stanford, Strategy and Insights Manager
Nick Jones, ED Destination Development
Fiona West, Procurement Coordinator
Carmela Ferraro, Manager Executive Services

TBWA key contacts:

KIMBERLEE WELLS, CEO.  https://www.linkedin.com/in/kimberlee-wells-73290b16/
PAUL REARDON, Chief Creative Officer. No linked in profile but career stretches across several advertising agencies such as Clemenger BBDO and accolades include two Cannes Grand Prix Lions (international advertising award)
CLIENTS INCLUDE: ANZ, Schweppes, Medibank, Department of Defence and Nissan. Example of their work can be found here https://www.tbwa.com.au/work

Hope that is sufficient. If you require anything else please let me know.

Cheers
Ben
From: Franchitto, David (DPC)
Sent: Wednesday, 16 May 2018 8:29 AM
To: Wood, Lucinda (DPC)
Subject: FW: Media Statement- Creative services

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Completed

From: Franchitto, David (DPC)
Sent: Thursday, 26 April 2018 11:12 AM
To: Jhaveri, Sibil (SATC) <Sibil.Jhaveri@sa.gov.au>
Cc: Tuffnell, Ben (SATC) <Ben.Tuffnell@sa.gov.au>
Subject: Re: Media Statement- Creative services

Hi Sibil,

Thank you very much.

Look forward to speaking this afternoon.

Thanks
David

Sent from my iPhone

On 26 Apr 2018, at 11:09 am, Jhaveri, Sibil (SATC) <Sibil.Jhaveri@sa.gov.au> wrote:

Hi David,

Hope you are well. I have updated the messages slightly in the document. Most updated here attached for reference. I will call you once KWP! Has been informed.

I am available on my mobile through the evening, in case you get any media queries.

Cheers
Sibil

Sibil Jhaveri
Corporate Communications Manager
Corporate Communications

South Australian Tourism Commission
Level 3 121-125 King William Street
Adelaide South Australia 5000
GPO Box 1972 Adelaide SA 5001

T 08 8463 4626   Clause 6(1)
E Sibil.Jhaveri@sa.gov.au
W southaustralia.com
W tourism.sa.gov.au
From: Jhaveri, Sibil (SATC)
Sent: Monday, 23 April 2018 1:18 PM
To: Franchitto, David (DPC) <David.Franchitto@sa.gov.au>
Cc: Tuffnell, Ben (SATC) <Ben.Tuffnell@sa.gov.au>
Subject: Media Statement- Creative services

Hi David,

Further to your discussion with Ben, here is a draft of the messaging for the Creative Services Tender. I am waiting for some information to update the jobs statement and will share that as soon as I have it.

Let me know if you need anything else in the meantime.

Cheers
Sibil

Sibil Jhaveri
Corporate Communications Manager
Corporate Communications

South Australian Tourism Commission
Level 3 121-125 King William Street
Adelaide South Australia 5000
GPO Box 1972 Adelaide SA 5001

T 08 8463 4626
E Sibil.Jhaveri@sa.gov.au
W southaustralia.com
W tourism.sa.gov.au

<Media Statement- Creative Services Tender.docx>
From: Franchitto, David (DPC)
Sent: Wednesday, 16 May 2018 8:29 AM
To: Wood, Lucinda (DPC)
Subject: FW: 27SATC18 - Provision of Creative Services
Attachments: 27SATC18 - Provision of Creative Services.docx; ATT00001.htm; 27SATC18 - Provision of Creative Services.pdf; ATT00002.htm

From: Schutz, Cecilia (DTTI)
Sent: Thursday, 26 April 2018 5:54 PM
To: Franchitto, David (DPC) <David.Fanchitto@sa.gov.au>
Subject: Fwd: 27SATC18 - Provision of Creative Services

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Tuffnell, Ben (SATC)" <Ben.Tuffnell@sa.gov.au>
Date: 26 April 2018 at 4:00:50 pm GMT+8
To: "Schutz, Cecilia (DTTI)" <Cecilia.Schutz@sa.gov.au>
Subject: Fwd: 27SATC18 - Provision of Creative Services
MINUTES forming ENCLOSURE to.

TO: HON DAVID RIDGWAY MLC
MINISTER FOR TRADE, TOURISM AND INVESTMENT

RE: PROVISION OF CREATIVE SERVICES

INTRODUCTION

To provide you with background information regarding the Creative Services tender process, and information on the agencies selected for both Primary and Secondary categories.

BACKGROUND

The South Australian Tourism Commission (SATC) engages creative service agencies (colloquially referred to as advertising agencies) to manage the production of its advertising globally.

The current Creative Services contract with KWPI expires on 30 June 2018.

The State Procurement Board requires that all agencies undertake an open market process for all new contracts. The value of the contract required the SATC to seek State Procurement Board approval for the acquisition plan (approval to purchase services). On 13 November 2017, the Procurement Approvals Committee of the State Procurement Board approved the acquisition for the establishment of a new contract for the provision of Creative Services to the SATC.

The procurement covered the engagement of a Primary agency and Secondary agencies. The Primary agency will manage the overall creative strategy for the higher profile global campaigns, and the Secondary agencies will handle short turn around campaigns, typically for domestic markets.

The procurement process was undertaken in accordance with the State Procurement Board guidelines and the market approach was an open Request for Tender (RFT). The tender closed on 18 December 2017. The process was facilitated throughout by an in-house Procurement Consultant, who also participated in all presentations made to the SATC.

Clause 16 Operations of Agencies
DISCUSSION

Primary Agency
Following an in-depth evaluation, TBWA was selected as the preferred Primary agency and will be the SATC’s lead global agency for creative services

Clause 7(1)(b) Contains commercial value to any agency or any other person, Clause 7(1)(c) Business Affairs
Secondary Agencies
Local Adelaide agencies Blacksheep, Fuller and Showpony were all selected as Secondary agencies.

Clause 7(1)(b) Contains commercial value to any agency or any other person, Clause 7(1)(c) Business Affairs

Issues

Engagement of a non-South Australian company
TBWA is not a South Australian company. TBWA’s Australian head office is in Melbourne and it has several international offices, including in Shanghai and Auckland.

TBWA has committed to having an account team and office space in Adelaide upon commencement of the contract to service the SATC.

The Adelaide team will be supported by TBWA/Melbourne and where possible its international offices, including Shanghai and Auckland, will also work with the SATC’s overseas teams.

The SATC will develop a communication plan to address questions regarding the engagement of an interstate company.

Clause 7(1)(b) Contains commercial value to any agency or any other person, Clause 7(1)(c) Business Affairs.
SUMMARY/CONCLUSION

The SATC through a thorough and detailed procurement process undertaken in accordance with the State Procurement Board guidelines and intends to commence contract negotiations with the preferred Primary agency, TBWA

The SATC also intends to commence discussions with Adelaide based agencies Blacksheep, Fuller and Showpony as Secondary agencies

ATTACHMENTS

Nil

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that you note this briefing

Hon David Ridgway MLC
Minister for Trade, Tourism and Investment

Date

☐ Approved
☐ Not Approved
☐ Noted

Other comment

[Signature]

CHIEF EXECUTIVE Rodney Harrison
Ph 8463 4501 Date 17 April 2018

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR Brent Hill
Ph 8463 Date April 2018

Prepared by Ph
Hi Elizabeth,

Here is the statement requested.

The SATC has worked with the incumbent agency KWP! for 20 years and the current Creative Services contract with KWP! expires on 30 June 2018. The State Procurement Board requires that all agencies undertake an open market process for new contracts. The procurement process was undertaken in accordance with the State Procurement Board guidelines and the market approach was an open Request for Tender (RFT). Five agencies were short-listed from a total of 35 who submitted entries and were initially evaluated by the panel facilitated throughout by an in-house Procurement Consultant. Four of the five agencies shortlisted were based interstate, with the incumbent KWP! being the only Adelaide based agency.

The SATC has appointed TBWA as the lead global agency for creative services, following this rigorous State procurement process.

TBWA is part of the Omnicom Group of companies with a worldwide network of media and communication agencies allowing the SATC access to a global creative talent pool. The agency is equipped to meet our creative services needs in our key international and domestic markets.

In addition, local Adelaide agencies Blacksheap, Fuller and Showpony were selected as Secondary agencies to take on ad hoc projects and tactical campaigns for the domestic market.
We thank the KWP! team for their hard work and commitment and wish them all the best for the future. We have shared many wins with KWP! along this 20-year journey. The campaigns designed by KWP! have been instrumental in our journey to a $6.6 bn visitor economy.

The 2020 tourism target of $8bn calls for a fresh perspective and some disruptive strategies which we believe TBWA is best placed to deliver.

Cheers
Sibii

Sent from my Samsung GALAXY S5 on the Telstra Mobile Network
Wood, Lucinda (DPC)

From: Thomas, Rowan (DSD)
Sent: Friday, 27 April 2018 12:02 PM
To: DPC:PCU; Stevens, James (DPC); Schutz, Cecilia (DTTI); Ridgway, David (DTTI)
Subject: FW: HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL: URGENT: RE: 27SATC18 - Provision of Creative Services

Dear James,

Please see below a brief regarding SATC Provision of Creative Services.

Kind regards,

Rowan Thomas
Advisor

Hon David Ridgway MLC
Minister for Trade, Tourism and Investment

Government of South Australia

DISCLAIMER:
Information contained in this e-mail message may be confidential and may also be the subject of legal professional privilege or public interest immunity. If you are not the intended recipient, any use, disclosure or copying of this document is unauthorised and may be subject to legal proceedings. If you received this correspondence in error, please immediately delete it from your system and notify the sender.

From: Trifonoff, Jenna (SATC)
Sent: Friday, 27 April 2018 11:48 AM
To: DTTI:Ministerials
Cc: Ferraro, Carmela (SATC); Tuffnell, Ben (SATC); Schutz, Cecilia (DTTI); Thomas, Rowan (DSD); Seeliger, Michael (DTTI)
Subject: RE: HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL: URGENT: RE: 27SATC18 - Provision of Creative Services

Dear All

Please find below the information requested by the Minister and DPC.

Note: any details regarding the identity of individual respondents, their submissions or ranking is commercial in confidence and highly confidential.

EVALUATION PROCESS
Ten stage process as follows:
Stage 1 Submissions Receipt, opening and grouping (Primary / Secondary);
Stage 2 Assessment of Completeness;
Stage 3 Risk Assessment based on submissions;
Stage 4 Assessment of mandatory criteria;
Stage 5 Office of Industry Advocate (IPP);
Stage 6 Assessment of qualitative criteria;
Stage 7 Shortlisting of 5 applicants (5 for Primary and 9 for Secondary) based on the written submission qualitative criteria score
Stage 8 Primary Shortlisted applicants presented creative ideas to the SATC in response to the SATC’s questions and in support of their written submission. Secondary Shortlist provided a further written submission. Adjustment of
qualitative criteria scoring based on assessment of the presentation. Clarification meetings in Melbourne with two top preferred agencies from Primary Shortlist.
Stage 9 Value of money assessment of the shortlisted applicants based on written submissions and original quoted hours for the retainer.
Stage 10 Due diligence checks on Primary preferred respondent and Recommendation

INHOUSE PROCUREMENT CONSULTANT
Allan Gadd attended evaluation meetings and presentations and provided support and advice to the evaluation panel throughout the procurement process.

EVALUATION CRITERIA
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mandatory Requirements</th>
<th>Assessment Type</th>
<th>Assessment Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of insurance status or intent for Public Liability</td>
<td>Compliance</td>
<td>Yes/No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaration in relation to Unlawful Collusion</td>
<td>Compliance</td>
<td>Yes/No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identification of any Conflicts of Interest</td>
<td>Compliance</td>
<td>Yes/No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confirmation of the completion of the IPP or ECT</td>
<td>Compliance</td>
<td>Yes/No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completion in full of the response document 'Part D'</td>
<td>Compliance</td>
<td>Yes/No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk Evaluation</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Financial Viability</td>
<td>Risk Assessment</td>
<td>Low/Medium/High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic and Financial capability, viability and stability</td>
<td>Risk Assessment</td>
<td>Low/Medium/High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual audited accounts</td>
<td>Risk Assessment</td>
<td>Low/Medium/High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial history - details of bankruptcy, insolvency, etc.</td>
<td>Risk Assessment</td>
<td>Low/Medium/High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compliance with indicative conditions of Contract</td>
<td>Risk Assessment</td>
<td>Low/Medium/High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience and expertise of key staff</td>
<td>Risk Assessment</td>
<td>Low/Medium/High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisational structure</td>
<td>Risk Assessment</td>
<td>Low/Medium/High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk Management Plan</td>
<td>Risk Assessment</td>
<td>Low/Medium/High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compliance with Part B Specification</td>
<td>Risk Assessment</td>
<td>Low/Medium/High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compliance with Part C Proposed Contract</td>
<td>Risk Assessment</td>
<td>Low/Medium/High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Capacity and Capabilities</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Case studies of similar campaigns, projects or engagements</td>
<td>Weighted Criteria</td>
<td>10.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 case studies of a similar size and complexity based on requirements</td>
<td>Weighted Criteria</td>
<td>15.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SA representation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide details regarding how facilitate on ground representation in SA with SAM capability</td>
<td>Weighted Criteria</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knowledge of the travel and tourism category</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>SA challenges and opportunities</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide details of what you know about South Australia as a travel destination. Please highlight what you consider to be South Australia’s key challenges and opportunities and what you think makes South Australia a unique destination for both domestic and international travellers.</td>
<td>Weighted Criteria</td>
<td>5.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key trends in travel industry</td>
<td>Weighted Criteria</td>
<td>5.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience with working in travel and tourism industry</td>
<td>Weighted Criteria</td>
<td>5.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SATC's core business objectives</td>
<td>Weighted Criteria</td>
<td>10.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide details of what you think SATC’s core business objectives are and the role that our marketing plays in achieving them.</td>
<td>Weighted Criteria</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant experience and past performance</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Relevant experience and performance</td>
<td>Weighted Criteria</td>
<td>7.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From: DTTI:Ministerials  
Sent: Thursday, 26 April 2018 6:08 PM  
To: SATC:Ministerials <Ministerials5@sa.gov.au>; Ferraro, Carmela (SATC) <Carmela.Ferraro@sa.gov.au>; Tuffnell, Ben (SATC) <Ben.Tuffnell@sa.gov.au>  
Cc: Schutz, Cecilia (DTTI) <Cecilia.Schutz@sa.gov.au>; Thomas, Rowan (DSD) <Rowan.Thomas@sa.gov.au>  
Subject: URGENT: RE: 27SATC18 - Provision of Creative Services  

To: SATC

Thank you for the provision of the minute and related PBN on the Creative Services contract.

However DPC and the Minister’s Office require extensive further detail on the procurement process of this tender in order to be fully prepared for questions relating to this matter.

Specifically the following:

- **indepth evaluation** – require extensive detail on the assessment process and methodology
- **inhouse procurement consultant** - who was part of the assessment panel and evaluation process
- **criteria** - what were the weighted criteria of the assessment process and the outcomes on the ranking
- **ranking** - where were each of the agencies ranked, why was the chosen agency so much better and how then panel came to this decision.

This information has been requested as **URGENT**– with ideally an response by Friday 27 April.

As I will be out of the office tomorrow – queries related to this request may be directed to Rowan Thomas – Ministerial Advisor. Cc’ed above.

The response to be returned to the DTTI:Ministerials email box and please also cc Rowan Thomas.
Your assistance in a quick turnaround of this request is sincerely appreciated.

Regards

Michael

Michael Seeliger
Ministerial Liaison Officer - Tourism

Hon David Ridgway MLC
Minister for Trade, Tourism and Investment

Level 13, State Administration Centre
200 Victoria Square
ADELAIDE SA 5000

T: 08 8226 1650

e: michael.seeliger2@sa.gov.au

Government of South Australia

DISCLAIMER:
Information contained in this e-mail message may be confidential and may also be the subject of legal professional privilege or public interest immunity. If you are not the intended recipient, any use, disclosure or copying of this document is unauthorised and may be subject to legal proceedings. If you received this correspondence in error, please immediately delete it from your system and notify the sender.

From: SATC:Ministerials
Sent: Wednesday, 18 April 2018 2:04 PM
To: DTTI:Office of Minister Ridgway <OfficeofMinisterRidgway@sa.gov.au>
Cc: Seeliger, Michael (DTTI) <Michael.Seeliger2@sa.gov.au>; Schutz, Cecilia (DTTI) <Cecilia.Schutz@sa.gov.au>
Subject: 27SATC18 - Provision of Creative Services

Good afternoon

Please find attached the minute for 27SATC18 - Provision of Creative Services.

Cecilia, please note this briefing is both urgent and important.

If you have any queries, please contact Carmela of Ben.

Kind regards

Jenna

Jenna Trifonoff
Executive Services Officer
Executive Services
David

Further to discussion tonight suggest following information is sought from SATC

- Was the former Minister made aware of the scope of the tender and did the minister seek any limitation of the scope so that only South Australian based companies could seek the contract?

If the answer to this is that the former Minister was aware and did nothing to limit the scope, then we can say that Labor is now rejecting the outcome of a process it did nothing to prevent when in government, it had the power to do so.

We should further ask SATC –

- Was the former minister advised of the five shortlisted tenders and if so, did he issue any instruction to limit the short list to South Australian companies only?

If the answer to this is that the former Minister was advised and took no further action, this further exposes the hypocrisy of Labor’s position now that the SATC’s decision should be overturned and a South Australian company given the contract instead.

Regards

Richard
From: Jhaveri, Sibil (SATC)
Sent: Saturday, 28 April 2018 3:03 PM
To: Franchitto, David (DPC) <David.Franchitto@sa.gov.au>
Cc: Ridgway, David (DTTI) <David.Ridgway@sa.gov.au>; Tuffnell, Ben (SATC) <Ben.Tuffnell@sa.gov.au>
Subject: Advertiser Response

Hi David,

Further to our discussion, here is the response we have sent to Tory.

---

On the general contract question:

The SATC promotes South Australia to Australia and the world. We are competing globally for the tourism dollar with hundreds of other tourism destinations. To continue our record expenditure and jobs growth we need to work with partners that that can give us a competitive advantage in a rapidly changing consumer market. It’s not just what we say about South Australia that counts – it’s how we connect and convert consumers to come here and spend that ultimately drives jobs and growth.

We follow procurement processes approved by the State Procurement Board that adhere to State Government Procurement Board guidelines to find the best contractors to support the SATC’s work. These processes include weighted evaluation criteria designed to maximise economic benefit to the State. This includes a 15% weighting for a party’s Industry Participation Plan.

On the Creative Services procurement there was a further 15% weighting for a party’s on the ground representation.

[Note: we are precluded by Free Trade Agreements and other international obligations from selecting parties based on their location of origin.]

---

On the PR Agency Contract question:

The SATC works with five PR agencies across our key markets interstate and overseas.

Our contract with Sydney based agency PEPR was up for renewal in January and in accordance
with our standard procurement processes, the SATC opened the contract up to a competitive tender process.

12 agencies submitted proposals of which seven were called for a face to face pitch. This included three South Australian agencies. Ultimately the contract was awarded to the agency that presented the best ideas and opportunities for South Australia.

The selected agency has a strong presence in our key interstate markets of Sydney and Melbourne.

It is worth noting that the previous agency that held our national account for over ten years was also Sydney based.

Cheers
Sibil

Sent from my Samsung GALAXY S5 on the Telstra Mobile Network
Hi David and Cecilia,

Hope you are well. We were approached for comment by InDaily specifically around the “international” criteria (email below)

Just FYI - We have sent the response below.

Cheers
Sibil

Sibil Jhaveri
Corporate Communications Manager
Corporate Communications
South Australian Tourism Commission
Level 3 121-125 King William Street
Adelaide South Australia 5000
GPO Box 1972 Adelaide SA 5001

T 08 8463 4626
E Sibil.Jhaveri@sa.gov.au
W southaustralia.com
W tourism.sa.gov.au

Hi David,

As Background:

- The tender document is a public document. The requirement to deliver and engage on an international basis is repeated 15 times in the tender documents and addenda. Here are a few screen shots for your reference.
- The tender process involves ten steps before the final agency is chosen. Each of those steps is designed to ensure the agency selected gives South Australia the best opportunity and value for money.
As outlined in the tender document, each of the agencies shortlisted were evaluated on the following criteria, with specific weightage awarded to each criteria, to ultimately determine contract winner.

In the case of SATC creative services contract- Each of the five agencies short-listed from a total of 35 who submitted applications were evaluated on the same platform against the same criteria
  o Capacity and Capability (case studies of similar campaigns, SA representation)
  o Knowledge of the travel and tourism industry (Key trends in travel, SA challenges and opportunities, understanding of SATC’s core business objectives),
  o Relevant experience and past performance (creative approach, challenger brand experience, integrated campaign experience, creative ideas on promoting SA in intrastate, interstate and international markets)
  o Industry Participation Plan/ Employment Contributions test

To ultimately win the contract, agencies need to perform well in each of these weighted areas.

In response to your specific question:

"Being part of a global network is not a mandatory requirement for the creative services tender, the ability to perform well against all the weighted criteria outlined in the tender ultimately determines who wins the contract. The process is designed to give each shortlisted candidate an equal opportunity to put their best ideas and competitive advantage forward.

As the contract winner, TBWA demonstrated impressive creativity, fresh, insightful thinking, excellent account management experience as well as in-depth understanding of the digital Adobe Marketing Cloud system and its ability to enhance the customer journey experience. They demonstrated contemporary knowledge of the national and global tourism landscape including the challenges South Australia faces. TBWA is part of the Omnicom Group of companies with a worldwide network of media and communication agencies allowing the SATC access to a global creative talent pool. The agency is equipped to meet our creative services needs in our key international and domestic markets.

SATC’s primary objective is to make sure that South Australia has the best opportunity to promote itself within Australia and internationally. We are competing globally for the tourism dollar with hundreds of other tourism destinations. To continue our record expenditure and jobs growth we need to work with partners that that can give us a competitive advantage in a rapidly changing consumer market. It’s not just what we say about South Australia that counts – it’s how we connect and convert consumers to come here and spend that ultimately drives jobs and growth."

Cheers
Sibil

Sibil Jhaveri
Corporate Communications Manager
Corporate Communications

South Australian Tourism Commission
Level 3 121-125 King William Street
Adelaide South Australia 5000
GPO Box 1972 Adelaide SA 5001

T 08 8463 4626  Clause 6(1)
E Sibil.Jhaveri@sa.gov.au
W southaustralia.com
W tourism.sa.gov.au

From: David Washington [mailto:dwashington@solsticemedia.com.au]
Sent: Monday, 30 April 2018 12:07 PM
To: Jhaveri, Sibil (SATC) <Sibil.Jhaveri@sa.gov.au>
Subject: Re: Advertising tender

Hi Sibil,

How is this coming along?

Regards,
David

David Washington | Editor | InDaily

---

From: "Jhaveri, Sibil (SATC)" <Sibil.Jhaveri@sa.gov.au>
Date: Monday, 30 April 2018 10:58 am
To: David Washington <dwashington@solticemedia.com.au>
Subject: RE: Advertising tender

HI David,

I will send through some information shortly. Speak soon.

Cheers
Sibil

Sibil Jhaveri
Corporate Communications Manager
Corporate Communications

South Australian Tourism Commission
Level 3 121-125 King William Street
Adelaide South Australia 5000
GPO Box 1972 Adelaide SA 5001

T 08 8463 4626
E Sibil.Jhaveri@sa.gov.au
W southaustralia.com
W tourism.sa.gov.au

From: David Washington [mailto:dwashington@solticemedia.com.au]
Sent: Monday, 30 April 2018 10:54 AM
To: Jhaveri, Sibil (SATC) <Sibil.Jhaveri@sa.gov.au>
Subject: Advertising tender

Hi Sibil,

KWP have told me that they are concerned that Rodney Harrex said publicly that the advertising contract was awarded to TBWA at least in part due to its strong global networks.

KWP says such a requirement was not included in the tender documents that they received did not include such a requirement and, if it was, they might not have tendered for the project. While they say they are capable of delivering international campaigns, they clearly do not have the global connections of a company such as TBWA.

Can you confirm whether these statements are correct or not?

Regards,
David

David Washington | Editor | InDaily
Hi Ashton,

Updated briefing note on SATC contract attached.

Please advise of any necessary changes in time for sitting tomorrow.

Alex, I will need to update your summarised briefing document and will proceed as soon as I have confirmation that the attached is satisfactory.

Thank you

Cecilia Schutz
Adviser
Hon David Ridgway MLC
Minister for Trade, Tourism and Investment

Level 13, State Administration Centre
200 Victoria Square
ADELAIDE SA 5000

T: 08 8226 8514 | F: 08 8226 8444
e: cecilia.schutz@sa.gov.au

DISCLAIMER:
Information contained in this e-mail message may be confidential and may also be the subject of legal professional privilege or public interest immunity. If you are not the intended recipient, any use, disclosure or copying of this document is unauthorised and may be subject to legal proceedings. If you received this correspondence in error, please immediately delete it from your system and notify the sender.
Wood, Lucinda (DPC)

From: Franchitto, David (DPC)
Sent: Wednesday, 16 May 2018 8:35 AM
To: Wood, Lucinda (DPC)
Subject: FW: 030518 PBN SATC Creative Contract.docx
Attachments: 030518 PBN SATC Creative Contract.docx

From: Schutz, Cecilia (DTTI)
Sent: Thursday, 3 May 2018 10:04 AM
To: May, Alexandra (DPC) <Alexandra.May@sa.gov.au>; Hurn, Ashton (DPC) <Ashton.Hurn@sa.gov.au>
Cc: Perry, Bradley (PIRSA) <Bradley.Perry@sa.gov.au>; Franchitto, David (DPC) <David.Franchitto@sa.gov.au>
Subject: 030518 PBN SATC Creative Contract.docx

Updated SATC parliamentary briefing note attached.

Cecilia Schutz
Adviser
Hon David Ridgway MLC
Minister for Trade, Tourism and Investment

Level 13, State Administration Centre
200 Victoria Square
ADELAIDE SA 5000

T: 08 8226 8514 | F: 08 8226 8444
e: cecilia.schutz@sa.gov.au

---

DISCLAIMER:
Information contained in this e-mail message may be confidential and may also be the subject of legal professional privilege or public interest immunity. If you are not the intended recipient, any use, disclosure or copying of this document is unauthorised and may be subject to legal proceedings. If you received this correspondence in error, please immediately delete it from your system and notify the sender.